Searching for Inclusive Excellence

November 2017

Susan Williams, PhD
Vice Dean
College of Arts and Sciences
We must lead our colleagues in exemplifying what it means to be an *inclusive university* in the 21\textsuperscript{st} century, a place where diversity is a defining characteristic and source of strength.
What do we mean by diversity?

Racial tensions led to student protests across the nation. Students are demanding:

- Greater student diversity
- Greater faculty diversity
- Diversity training for all students, faculty and staff
- Greater support for multicultural student services
College of Arts and Sciences
Head Count - Tenure Track Faculty by Gender

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>37%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>73%</td>
<td>71%</td>
<td>67%</td>
<td>63%</td>
<td>63%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>2000</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2015</th>
<th>2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>277</td>
<td>300</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>353</td>
<td>351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>732</td>
<td>718</td>
<td>672</td>
<td>605</td>
<td>599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Head Count</td>
<td>1,009</td>
<td>1,018</td>
<td>1,005</td>
<td>958</td>
<td>950</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
College of Arts and Sciences
Head Count - Tenure Track Faculty by Ethnicity

2000
- Am. Indian: 0%
- Asian: 4%
- Black: 2%
- Hispanic: 1%
- Two or More Races: 0%
- Undisclosed: 1%
- White: 43%

2017
- Am. Indian: 0%
- Asian: 6%
- Black: 2%
- Hispanic: 2%
- Two or More Races: 1%
- Undisclosed: 3%
- White: 35%
Gender and race gaps arise:

- academic hiring
- promotion success
- publication biases
- salary issues
- micro-aggressions
- chilly atmospheres
- explicit harassment

African American Proportion of U.S. Faculty

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Proportion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>4.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2013</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

180 YEARS

2200 Parity

Jackson-Weaver, et al. “Recruiting the Next Generation of the Professoriate”

*peerReview*, 12:3, 2010
Six Steps to Inclusive Hiring:

1) Examine our own biases
2) Prime the pump (recruit before you need it)
3) Build an effective search committee
4) Define your search as broadly as possible
5) Thoughtfully evaluate candidates
6) Host an effective visit
We all perceive and treat people differently based on their social groups—race/ethnicity, gender, sexual orientation, disability, etc.

Conditions under which our reliance on cognitive shortcuts is greater, and thus unconscious biases are more impactful:

- Stress; competing tasks
- Time pressure
- Lack of critical mass
- Ambiguity & lack of information
• Male and female psychology professors chose to hire “Brian” over “Karen” by a factor of 2 to 1, despite identical CVs. Steinpreis, Ritzke & Anders (1999)

• Gender differences in letters of recommendation for successful medical school faculty applicants

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Letters for men:</th>
<th>Letters for women:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Longer</td>
<td>• Shorter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• More references to:</td>
<td>• More references to personal life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CV</td>
<td>• More “doubt raisers”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Publications</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Patients</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Colleagues</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Unconscious Attitudes Affect Evaluation of Identical C.V.s

Applicants with African American-sounding names had to send 15 resumes to get a callback, compared to 10 needed by applicants with white-sounding names.

White names yielded as many more callbacks as an additional eight years of experience.

1) Examine Our Own Biases: awareness is an intervention in itself

Harvard University’s Project Implicit and the Implicit Association Test: https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/demo/
Before the search and ongoing:

2) Prime the pump:
   - Network directly with young scholars
   - At conferences, attend the special interest sessions where diverse candidates can be found
   - Widen the pool from which you recruit: actively pursue candidates thriving at less well-ranked institutions
   - Send faculty and/or graduate students to national conferences for women and persons of color
   - Reconsider taboo practices such as hiring our own students
3) Build an Effective Search Committee

Search guide: https://hr.osu.edu/private/talent/guide-to-effective-searches.pdf

- Require and reward a high level of commitment.
- Be aware of unconscious bias and the challenges of evaluation.
- Include people openly committed to diversity and excellence. Invite faculty from other departments to increase committee diversity.
- Appoint a diversity advocate who understands policies and guidelines and assists the committee in self-scrutiny about its own potential biases.
4) Define search as broadly as possible

- The broader the job ad, the larger the pool
- Emphasize interdisciplinarity and opportunities to work on broad issues
- Describe specialties you want in terms that will appeal to a broad audience
4) Define your search as broadly as possible (continued)

• Broaden marketing venues to target under-represented groups, including newsletters, specialty groups, websites

• Use proactive language in the job description
5) Thoughtfully Evaluate Candidates:

• Explicitly discuss the criteria that define “excellence” in advance. Do not accept “we’ll know it when we see it” definitions.

• Discuss essential job qualifications. Be sure they are explicit and agreed upon. Develop a consistent screening tool.
5) Thoughtfully Evaluate Candidates (continued):

Please indicate which of the following are true for you (check all that apply):

- Read candidate's CV
- Read candidate's scholarship
- Read candidate's letters of recommendation
- Attended candidate's job talk
- Met with candidate
- Attended lunch or dinner with candidate
- Other (please explain):

Please rate the candidate on each of the following:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Potential for (Evidence of) scholarly impact</th>
<th>excellent</th>
<th>good</th>
<th>neutral</th>
<th>fair</th>
<th>poor</th>
<th>unable to judge</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Potential for (Evidence of) research productivity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential for (Evidence of) research funding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential for (Evidence of) collaboration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fit with department's priorities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ability to make positive contribution to department's climate</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential (Demonstrated ability) to attract and supervise graduate students</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential (Demonstrated ability) to teach and supervise undergraduates</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Potential (Demonstrated ability) to be a conscientious university community member</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

http://www.umich.edu/%7Eadyproj/CandidateEvaluationTool.doc
6) Host an Effective Visit

- Provide information well ahead of the visit regarding schedule, expectations, audience.
- Ask the candidate whom s/he would like to meet. Treat all applicants as valuable scholars and educators, not representatives of a class.
- Show equal interest in all candidates.
- Show OSU/unit commitment to diversity; make sure all candidates meet with diverse people.
6) Host an Effective Visit

- Identify a host who can set the tone for the visit and provide a good introduction at the seminar.

- Work with your college chief diversity officer to prepare a visit that communicates Ohio State’s commitment to diversity.

- Consider the Q&A culture in your department.

Be aware of cues in the environment and the messages they convey.
6) Host an Effective Visit (continued)

- Create a packet for all candidates with information on the following:
  - Dual career support
  - Family friendly policies
  - Faculty rules on tenure clock extension
  - Local communities

- Provide the same information to all candidates.
Stick with Job-Relevant Factors

- Only evaluate relevant qualifications
- Do not seek or discuss information about dual career or family status
- Consider the unintended consequences of personal questions

If these questions arise from the candidate:
- Answer the question
- Do not ask further probing questions
- Set up resources outside of the search committee in advance and direct candidate there
Recruiting the Selected Candidate

- After a candidate is selected, aggressive recruiting begins.

- Negotiation process should convey that the goal in deciding the offer terms is to create conditions for success.

Build a culture of search excellence.
Additional Resources

- Portions of today’s presentation are from University of Michigan’s STRIDE program (scroll down to faculty recruitment resources): http://sitemaker.umich.edu/advance/stride_committee

Additional Resources:
- University of Wisconsin-Madison, WISELI: http://wiseli. engr. wisc. edu/hiring. php#resources
- University of Rhode Island, ADVANCE: http://www.uri.edu/advance/recruitment.html

Additional resources are available on the Discovery Themes website http://u.osu.edu/discoverythemasieres/

These include links to the Presidential search’s packet describing the central Ohio community, links to the IAT, links to OSU HR videos on implicit bias, and links to the STRIDE website and presentation. We recommend that you review these resources and discuss how you will use them with your search committee.
• Looking at the demographics of your unit, WHO is not represented?

• Given the challenges of the pool, WHAT strategies can you use to enhance the diversity of candidate pools in the future?